

THE REVIEW OF POLITICS

Politics and Linguistics

Arnold J. Heidenheimer

Nuclear War: Bishops and Scholars

Francis X. Winters

Simone Weil on Rights

Edward Andrew

James Madison and Modern Politics

Peter Augustine Lawler

Vol. 48 Winter, 1986 No. 1

University of Notre Dame
Notre Dame, Indiana

THE REVIEW OF POLITICS

Editor
DONALD P. KOMMERS

Managing Editor
DENNIS WM MORAN

Associate Editors
Phillip Gleason
Thomas Stritch
Thomas Werge

Book Review Editor
Walter Niegorski

Former Editors

Waldemar Gurian
M. A. Fitzsimons

Thomas Stritch
Frederick J. Crosson

Editorial Advisory Board

Henry J. Abraham
University of Virginia

Penny T. Gill
Mount Holyoke College

Charles W. Anderson
University of Wisconsin-Madison

Gerald Garvey
Princeton University

Shlomo Avineri
Hebrew University of Jerusalem

Arend Lijphart
University of California-San Diego

Walter Dean Burnham
Massachusetts Institute of Technology

Alasdair MacIntyre
Vanderbilt University

Robert F. Byrnes
Indiana University

Harvey C. Mansfield, Jr.
Harvard University

Eugeen De Jonghe
Catholic University-Louvain

John R. Schmidhauser
University of Southern California

Ernest L. Fortin
Boston College

Glenn Tinder
University of Massachusetts-Boston

THE REVIEW OF POLITICS, without neglecting the analysis of institutions and techniques, is primarily interested in the philosophical and historical approach to political realities.

The articles in THE REVIEW OF POLITICS are indexed in the International Index to Periodicals and the Index of Catholic Periodicals and abstracted in the International Political Science Abstracts. They are abstracted and indexed in ABC POL. SCI. and HISTORICAL ABSTRACTS and Social Sciences Index.

THE REVIEW OF POLITICS (ISSN 0034-6705) is published four times a year for \$20.00 per year in the United States (Individual, \$15.00); foreign \$17.00; single copies, \$5.00 by The University of Notre Dame, P.O. Box B, Notre Dame, IN 46556. Second-class postage paid at Notre Dame, IN. POSTMASTER: Send address changes to THE REVIEW OF POLITICS, P.O. Box B, Notre Dame, IN 46556.

THE REVIEW OF POLITICS

**Volume XLVIII
1986**

Editor: Donald P. Kommers

Managing Editor: Dennis Wm Moran

Issued each January, April, July and October

Opinions expressed in the articles printed in THE REVIEW OF POLITICS are those of the authors alone and are not necessarily opinions held by the editors.

Subscriptions: Institutional, \$20.00 the year in the United States (Individual, \$15.00); foreign, \$17.00; single copies, \$5.00.

Entered as second-class matter, April 1, 1939, at the Post Office at Notre Dame, Indiana, under the act of March 3, 1879.

**PUBLISHED BY THE UNIVERSITY OF NOTRE DAME
NOTRE DAME, INDIANA 46556**

Index of Articles, 1986

Edward Andrew, <i>Simone Weil on the Injustice of Right-Based Doctrines</i>	60
Sotirios Barber, <i>Epistemological Skepticism, Hobbesian Natural Right and Judicial Self-Restraint</i>	374
W. David Clinton, <i>The National Interest: Normative Foundations</i>	495
Robert Eden, <i>Tocqueville on Political Realignments and Constitutional Forms</i>	349
Michael Haas, <i>Metaphysics of Paradigms in Political Science: Theoriee of Urban Unrest</i>	520
Arnold J. Heidenheimer, <i>Politics, Policy and Polickey as Concepts in English and Continental Languages: An Attempt to Explain Divergences</i>	3
Stephen P. Hoffman, <i>The GDR, Luther, and the German Question</i>	246
Peter Augustine Lawler, <i>James Madison and the Metaphysics of Modern Politics</i>	92
Maureen Manion, <i>The Impact of State Aid on Sectarian Higher Education: The Case of New York State</i>	264
Arthur S. Miller and H. Bart Cox, <i>Congress, The Constitution and First Use of Nuclear Weapons (Part I)</i>	211
Arthur S. Miller and H. Bart Cox, <i>Congress, The Constitution and First Use of Nuclear Weapons (Part II)</i>	424
Walter F. Murphy, <i>Who Shall Interpret? The Quest For the Ultimate Constitutional Interpreter</i>	401
H. Mark Roelofs, <i>The American Polity: A Systematic Ambiguity</i>	323
S. N. Sang-Mpam, <i>State-Society Relationship in Peripheral Countries: Critical Notes on the Dominant Paradigms</i>	596
Donald Share, <i>The Franquist Regime and the Dilemma of Succession</i>	549
Francis X. Winters, <i>Bishops and Scholars: The Peace Pastoral Under Siege</i>	31
John Yoder, <i>Surrender: A Moral Imperative</i>	576
Michael P. Zuckert, <i>Federalism and the Founding: Toward a Reinterpretation of the Constitutional Convention</i>	166

Index of Book Reviews, 1986

Arblaster, Anthony, <i>The Rise and Decline of Western Liberalism</i> (Nancy Rosenblum)	305
Barkan, Joanne, <i>Visions of Emancipation: The Italian Workers' Movement Since 1945</i> (Robert H. Evans)	148
Braley, Russ, <i>Bad News: The Foreign Policy of the New York Times</i> (Bernard Norling)	141
Canavan, Francis, S.J., <i>Freedom of Expression: Purpose as Limit</i> (Christopher Wolfe)	139
Carmen, Ira H., <i>Cloning and the Constitution</i> (John B. Attanasio)	476
Carter, Lief H., <i>Contemporary Constitutional Lawmaking</i> (William I. Buscemi)	488
Cohen, Eliot A., <i>Citizens and Soldiers: The Dilemmas of Military Service</i> (Richard S. Hartigan)	655

Cohen, Stuart A. and Elazar, Daniel J., <i>The Jewish Polity: Jewish Political Organization from Biblical Times to the Present</i> (Jonathan S. Woocher)	618
Coll, Alberto R., <i>The Wisdom of Statecraft: Sir Herbert Butterfield and the Philosophy of International Politics</i> (Gerhart Niemeyer)	631
Davis, Nathaniel, <i>The Last Two Years of Salvador Allende</i> (Michael Francis)	295
DeBardeleben, Joan, <i>The Environment and Marxism-Leninism: The Soviet East and German Experience</i> (Zachary A. Smith)	626
Donahue, William A., <i>The Politics of the American Civil Liberties Union</i> (John R. Schmidhauser)	641
Edelman, Martin, <i>Democratic Theories and the Constitution</i> (Donald A. Downs)	135
Elazar, Daniel J. and Cohen, Stuart A., <i>The Jewish Polity: Jewish Political Organization from Biblical Times to the Present</i> (Jonathan S. Woocher)	635
Ericksen, Robert P., <i>Theologians Under Hitler</i> (Arthur C. Cochrane)	617
Feinberg, Joel, <i>Offense to Others: The Moral Limits of the Criminal Law</i> (Robert E. Rodes, Jr.)	481
Furtwangler, Albert, <i>The Authority of Publius: A Reading of the Federalist Papers</i> (Murray Dry)	314
Geertz, Clifford, <i>Local Knowledge: Further Essays in Interpretive Anthropology</i> (Kenneth Moore)	647
Gendzier, Irene L., <i>Managing Political Change: Social Scientists and the Third World</i> (Ernest Bartell)	290
Hanson, Russell L., <i>The Democratic Imagination in America</i> (Robert K. Faulkner)	483
Henderson, William Daryl, <i>Cohesion: The Human Element in Combat</i> (Richard S. Hartigan)	655
Holmes, Stephen, <i>Benjamin Constant and the Making of Modern Liberalism</i> (M. E. Brint)	302
Jervis, Robert, <i>The Illogic of American Nuclear Strategy</i> (Gerald Garvey)	652
Jones, Howard, <i>The Course of American Diplomacy: From the Revolution to the Present</i> (David S. McLellan)	649
Kahler, Miles, <i>Decolonization in Britain and France: The Domestic Consequences of International Relations</i> (Anthony M. Messina)	145
Kertesz, Stephen, <i>The Last European Peace Conference</i> (Leslie C. Tihany)	317
Ketchum, Ralph, <i>Presidents Above Party: The First American Presidency, 1789-1829</i> (Kent A. Kirwan)	125
Krepon, Michael, <i>Strategic Stalemate: Nuclear Weapons and Arms Control in American Politics</i> (Gerald Garvey)	652
Lamis, Alexander P., <i>The Two-Party South</i> (Frank J. Sorauf)	639
Lock, F. P., <i>Burke's Reflections on the Revolution in France</i> (Francis Canavan)	629
Lowi, Theodore, J., <i>The Personal President: Power Invested, Promise Unfulfilled</i> (Kent A. Kirwan)	125
MacRae, Duncan, Jr., <i>Policy Indicators: Links between Social Science and Public Debate</i> (Roseanna M. Mirabella)	644
Makin, John H., <i>The Global Debt Crisis</i> (James J. Rakowski)	151
Malone, Peter, <i>The British Nuclear Deterrent</i> (Anthony M. Messina)	145

Marshall, Peter H., <i>William Godwin</i> (Rodney W. Kilcup).....	133
Marx, Werner, <i>The Philosophy of F. W. J. Schelling</i> (Lewis P. Hinchman)...	299
Metha, Vrajendra Raj., <i>Ideology, Modernization and Politics in India</i> (Fred R. Dallmayr).....	621
Morgan, Richard E., <i>Disabling America: The "Rights Industry" in Our Times</i> (John R. Schmidhauser)	641
Pennington, Kenneth, <i>Pope and Bishop: The Papal Monarchy in the Twelfth and Thirteenth Centuries</i> (John Van Engen)	130
Porritt, Jonathan, <i>Seeing Green: The Politics of Ecology Explained</i> (Zachary A. Smith)	312
Rodes, Robert E., Jr., <i>Law and Liberation and Common Sense</i> (George Anastaplo)	472
Rumble, W. E., <i>The Thought of John Austin, Jurisprudence, Colonial Reform, and the British Constitution</i> (Cornelius F. Murphy)	469
Silbey, Joel H., <i>The Partisan Imperative: The Dynamics of American Politics Before the Civil War</i> (Frank J. Sorauf)	639
Simon, Yves R., <i>The Community of the Free</i> (Robert L. Spaeth).....	121
Staniland, Martin, <i>What Is Political Economy?</i> (Ernest Bartell).....	290
Tarcov, Nathan, <i>Locke's Education for Liberty</i> (Robert H. Horwitz)	308
Tribe, Laurence H., <i>God Save This Honorable Court: How the Choice of Supreme Court Justices Shape Our History</i> (John H. Robinson)	463
Tusa, Ann, and Tusa, John, <i>The Nuremberg Trials</i> (Joseph W. Bendersky) ..	123
Tusa, John, and Tusa, Ann, <i>The Nuremberg Trials</i> (Joseph W. Bendersky) ..	123
Von Beyme, Klaus, <i>Political Parties in Western Democracies</i> (Leon D. Epstein)	637
Weinstein, Michael A., <i>Finite Perfection: Reflections on Virtue</i> (Gilbert Meilaender)	298
Wolfe, Christopher, <i>The Rise of Modern Judicial Review: From Constitutional Interpretation to Judge-Made Law</i> (C. Herman Pritchett).....	467
Youngs, J. William T., <i>Eleanor Roosevelt: A Personal and Public Life</i> (Vincent P. DeSantis).....	127

THE REVIEW OF POLITICS

Published Quarterly by the University of Notre Dame, Indiana

Vol. 48

Winter, 1986

No. 1

ARNOLD J. HEIDENHEIMER

Politics, Policy and Policity as Concepts in English and Continental Languages: An Attempt to Explain Divergences 3

FRANCIS X. WINTERS

Bishops and Scholars: The Peace Pastoral Under Siege 31

EDWARD ANDREW

Simone Weil on the Injustice of Rights-Based Doctrines 60

PETER AUGUSTINE LAWLER

James Madison and the Metaphysics of Modern Politics 92

Communications:

David Felix: Reply to Rhodes 116

James M. Rhodes: Rejoinder to Felix 118

Reviews:

Robert L. Spaeth: *Simon's Moderate Pessimism* 121

Joseph W. Bendersky: *Law and Politics at Nuremberg* 123

Kent A. Kirwan: *The Presidency: Early Years and Present Reality* 125

Vincent P. DeSantis: *Development In and Into Service* 127

John Van Engen: *Papal Sovereignty and Episcopal Privilege* 130

Rodney W. Kilcup: *Calvinist and Atheist* 133

Donald A. Downs: *Reaching Beyond Democracy as Process* 135

Christopher Wolfe: *The Limits of Free Speech* 139

Bernard Norling: *Fearlessly Filtering the News* 141

Anthony M. Messina: *The Politics of Decline* 145

Robert H. Evans: *Labor and Communism in Italy* 148

James J. Rakowski: *Folly and Greed Aside* 151

Contributors to This Issue

ARNOLD J. HEIDENHEIMER is Professor of Political Science in Washington University in St. Louis. FRANCIS X. WINTERS, S.J., is Associate Professor of Theological Ethics and International Relations in Georgetown University; he served as Consultant to the National Conference of Catholic Bishops during the preparation of the Pastoral Letter. EDWARD ANDREW teaches political theory in Scarborough College of the University of Toronto. PETER AUGUSTINE LAWLER is Associate Professor of Political Science in Berry College, Georgia.

ROBERT L. SPAETH is Dean of Arts and Sciences in St. John's University, Collegeville. JOSEPH W. BENDERSKY is a member of the Department of History in the Virginia Commonwealth University, Richmond. KENT A. KIRWAN is Professor of Political Science in the University of Nebraska at Omaha. VINCENT P. DESANTIS is Professor Emeritus in Notre Dame's Department of History. JOHN VAN ENGEN is Director of the Medieval Institute of the University of Notre Dame and Associate Professor of History. RODNEY W. KILCUP teaches in the Wm. D. Clark Honors College of the University of Oregon. DONALD A. DOWNS is a member of the Department of Political Science in the University of Wisconsin. CHRISTOPHER WOLFE is Assistant Professor of Political Science in Marquette University. BERNARD NORLING teaches history in the University of Notre Dame. ANTHONY M. MESSINA is Assistant Professor of Government at Notre Dame. ROBERT H. EVANS is Professor and Chairman of the Department of Government and Foreign Affairs in the University of Virginia. JAMES J. RAKOWSKI is Associate Professor of Economics at Notre Dame.

INSTRUCTIONS TO CONTRIBUTORS

All manuscripts should be submitted in QUADRUPLICATE to *The Review in Politics*, Box B, Notre Dame, IN 46556. If the return of the manuscript is desired, a stamped, self-addressed envelope should be enclosed. All typewritten material should be double-spaced, including notes and quotations; photocopies of a good quality are acceptable. *The Review* follows the *Chicago Manual of Style* for standards of citation, punctuation and other editorial considerations. The normal length of manuscripts published is 25-30 pages. Longer manuscripts will be evaluated in light of the limited printing space available. Since manuscripts are evaluated anonymously they should not bear the author's name or institutional affiliation. Submissions should be sent with an ABSTRACT of 100-150 words. All correspondence regarding book reviews should be sent to Mr. Walter Niegorski at the above address.