

VOLUME 19  
NUMBER 1  
MARCH 1996

An International Journal of Current Research  
and Theory with Open Peer Commentary

---

# Behavioral and Brain Sciences

---

Appearing in this issue, with Commentary . . .

**The base rate fallacy reconsidered: Descriptive, normative,  
and methodological challenges** Jonathan J. Koehler

**What are "normal movements" in atypical populations?** Mark L. Latash  
& J. Greg Anson

**Intentional relations and social understanding** John Barresi & Chris Moore

Also, Continuing Commentary on  
***Précis of "Origins of the Modern Mind"*** (Donald)

CAMBRIDGE

ISSN 0140-525X

# Behavioral and Brain Sciences

## Editor

Stevan Harnad

**E-mail:** [bbs@ecs.soton.ac.uk](mailto:bbs@ecs.soton.ac.uk)

Behavioral and Brain Sciences  
Department of Psychology  
University of Southampton  
Highfield, Southampton SO17 1BJ  
United Kingdom

## Managing Editor

Henriette Korthals Altes

## Production Coordinator

Edward D. Miller

## Chief Copy Editor

Erika Kors

## Associate Editors

### *Behavioral Biology*

Jack P. Hailman/U. Wisconsin  
Hubert Markl/U. Konstanz

### *Biosocial Behavior*

Glendon Schubert/U. Hawaii, Manoa

### *Cognition and Artificial Intelligence*

Zenon Pylyshyn/U. Western Ontario

### *Cognitive Development*

Annette Karmiloff-Smith/MRC, London

### *Computational Neuroscience*

Stephen Grossberg/Boston U.

### *Evolutionary Biology*

Michael T. Ghiselin/California Academy of Sciences

### *Experimental Analysis of Behavior*

A. Charles Catania/U. Maryland, Baltimore County

### *History and Systems*

Julian Jaynes/Princeton

### *Language and Cognition*

Philip Johnson-Laird/Princeton

### *Language and Language Disorders*

Max Coltheart/Macquarie U.

### *Linguistics*

Robert Freidin/Princeton

### *Neurobiology*

Irving Kupfermann/Columbia

### *Neurobehavioral Genetics*

Wim E. Crusio/Centre National de la Recherche Scientifique

### *Neuropsychology*

Jeffrey A. Gray/Inst. Psychiatry, London  
John C. Marshall/Radcliffe Infirmary, Oxford

### *Neurophysiology*

Sten Grillner/Karolinska Institutet

### *Paleoneurology*

Stephen Jay Gould/Harvard

### *Perception*

Bruce Bridgeman/U. California  
Richard Gregory/U. Bristol

### *Philosophy*

Daniel C. Dennett/Tufts  
Gilbert Harman/Princeton

### *Philosophy of Science*

Adolf Grünbaum/U. Pittsburgh  
Massimo Piatelli-Palmarini/MIT

### *Primateology*

Horst D. Steklis/Rutgers

### *Psychobiology*

Victor H. Denenberg/U. Connecticut

### *Vision and Artificial Intelligence*

Stuart Sutherland/U. Sussex

**Editorial Policy** *Behavioral and Brain Sciences* (BBS) is an international journal providing a special service called Open Peer Commentary\* to researchers in any area of psychology, neuroscience, behavioral biology, or cognitive science who wish to solicit, from fellow specialists within and across these BBS disciplines, multiple responses to a particularly significant and controversial piece of work. (See *Instructions for Authors and Commentators*, inside back cover.) The purpose of this service is to contribute to the communication, criticism, stimulation, and particularly the unification of research in the behavioral and brain sciences, from molecular neurobiology to artificial intelligence and the philosophy of mind.

Papers judged by the editors and referees to be appropriate for Commentary are circulated to a large number of commentators selected by the editors, referees, and author to provide substantive criticism, interpretation, elaboration, and pertinent complementary and supplementary material from a full cross-disciplinary perspective. The article, accepted commentaries, and the author's response then appear simultaneously in BBS.

Commentary on BBS articles may be provided by any qualified professional in the behavioral and brain sciences, but much of it is drawn from a large body of BBS Associates who have become formally affiliated with the project.

Qualified professionals are eligible to become BBS Associates if they have (1) been nominated by a current BBS Associate, (2) refereed for BBS, or (3) had a commentary or article accepted for publication. A special subscription rate is available to Associates. Individuals interested in serving as BBS Associates are asked to write the editor.

**Copying** This journal is registered with the Copyright Clearance Center (222 Rosewood Dr., Danvers, MA 01923). Organizations in the U.S.A. who are also registered with the CCC may therefore copy material (beyond the limits permitted by sections 107 and 108 of U.S. Copyright Law) subject to payment to the CCC of the per-copy fee indicated in the code on the first page of the article. This consent does not extend to multiple copying for promotional or commercial purposes. ISI Genuine Article Service, 3501 Market Street, Philadelphia, PA 19104, is authorized to supply single copies of separate articles for private use only. For all other use, permission should be sought from the Cambridge or New York offices of the Press.

**Subscriptions** *Behavioral and Brain Sciences* (ISSN 0140-525X) is published quarterly in March, June, September, and December. The subscription price for institutions of Volume 19 (1996) is US \$230.00 net in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico; UK £156.00 in the rest of the world; for individuals US \$92.00 net (£60.00); for BBS Associates and for students (in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico only) with proof of eligibility with order US \$51.00 net (£38.00). Subscription price includes surface postage.

Single parts cost US \$60.00 net (£40.00) plus postage. Institutional orders may be sent to a bookseller, or, in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico direct to: Cambridge University Press, 40 West 20 Street, New York, NY 10011-4211; in the U.K. and rest of the world to: Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 2RU, England. Individuals must order direct from the Press. Second class postage paid at New York, N.Y., and at additional mailing offices. **Postmaster:** Send address changes in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico to *Behavioral and Brain Sciences*, Cambridge University Press, Journals Dept., 110 Midland Ave., Port Chester, NY 10573.

**Advertising** Inquiries about advertising should be sent to the Journals Advertising Department of the Cambridge or New York Office of Cambridge University Press.

\*Modelled on the 'CA Comment' service of the journal *Current Anthropology*.

# Contents Volume 19:1 March 1996

<b>Koehler, J. J.</b> The base rate fallacy reconsidered: Descriptive, normative, and methodological challenges	1
-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	---

## Open Peer Commentary

<b>Anderson, N. H.</b> Cognitive algebra versus representativeness heuristic	17	<b>Krueger, J.</b> Studying the use of base rates: Normal science or shifting paradigm?	30
<b>Callen, C. R.</b> The implications of Koehler's approach for fact-finding	18	<b>Kyburg, H. E., Jr.</b> Probabilistic fallacies	31
<b>Cohen, L. J.</b> The need for a theory of evidential weight	18	<b>Levi, I.</b> Fallacy and controversy about base rates	31
<b>Connolly, T.</b> Are base rates a natural category of information?	19	<b>Margolis, H.</b> Nuancing should not imply neglecting	32
<b>Dawes, R. M.</b> The purpose of experiments: Ecological validity versus comparing hypotheses	20	<b>McCauley, C.</b> First things first: What is a base rate?	33
<b>Edgell, S. E., Roe, R. M. &amp; Dodd, C. H.</b> Base rates, experience, and the big picture	21	<b>McKenzie, C. R. M. &amp; Soll, J. B.</b> Which reference class is evoked?	34
<b>Fernandez-Berrocal, P., Almaraz, J. &amp; Segura, S.</b> How to reconsider the base rate fallacy without forgetting the concept of systematic processing	21	<b>McLeod, P. J. &amp; Watt, M.</b> How are base rates used? Interactive and group effects	35
<b>Funder, D. C.</b> Base rates, stereotypes, and judgmental accuracy	22	<b>Melone, N. P. &amp; McGuire, T. W.</b> Conservatism revisited: Base rates, prior probabilities, and averaging strategies	36
<b>Gigerenzer, G.</b> Why do frequency formats improve Bayesian reasoning? Cognitive algorithms work on information, which needs representation	23	<b>Quinsey, V. L.</b> Improving decision accuracy where base rates matter: The prediction of violent recidivism	37
<b>Ginzburg, L. R., Janson, C. &amp; Ferson, S.</b> Judgment under uncertainty: Evolution may not favor a probabilistic calculus	24	<b>Spellman, B. A.</b> The implicit use of base rates in experiential and ecologically valid tasks	38
<b>Hamm, R. M.</b> Physicians neglect base rates, and it matters	25	<b>Stalker, D.</b> Where do you stand on the base rate issue?	38
<b>Keren, G. &amp; Thijs, L. J.</b> The base rate controversy: Is the glass half-full or half-empty?	26	<b>Thomsen, C. T. &amp; Borgida, E.</b> Throwing out the baby with the bathwater? Let's not overstate the overselling of the base rate fallacy	39
<b>Klar, Y.</b> P(D/H), P(D/~H) and base rate consideration	26	<b>Vicente, K. J.</b> The perils of reconstructive remembering and the value of representative design	40
<b>Kleiter, G. D.</b> Critical and natural sensitivity to base rates	27	<b>Windschitl, P. D. &amp; Wells, G. L.</b> Base rates do not constrain nonprobability judgments	40
<b>Koonce, L.</b> Base rates in the applied domain of accounting	29		
		<b>Author's Response</b>	
		<b>Koehler, J. J.</b> Issues for the next generation of base rate research	41

<b>Latash, M. L. &amp; Anson, J. G.</b> What are "normal movements" in atypical populations?	55
----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	----

## Open Peer Commentary

<b>Aruin, A. S.</b> Adaptive changes in postural reactions after unilateral leg amputation	68	<b>Kasai, T.</b> Anticipatory postural mechanisms: Some evidence and methodological mechanisms	77
<b>Berardelli, A., Agostino, R., Currà, A. &amp; Manfredi, M.</b> Bradykinesia in Parkinson's disease and cocontraction activity in dystonia are unlikely to be due to adaptive changes in the CNS	69	<b>Klatzky, R. L.</b> What makes a population atypical—priorities or constraints?	78
<b>Biryukova, E. V., Frolov, A. A., Burnod, Y. &amp; Roby-Brami, A.</b> Evaluation of central commands: Toward a theoretical basis for rehabilitation	69	<b>Konczak, J. &amp; Dichgans, J.</b> The concept of "normal" movement and its consequences for therapy	79
<b>Bouisset, S.</b> Posturo-kinetic capacity in the disabled	71	<b>Levin, M. F.</b> Should stereotypic movement synergies in hemiparetic patients be considered adaptive?	79
<b>Burton, A. W.</b> Dynamic similarities in action systems	71	<b>Martin-Iverson, M. T.</b> Theories need data and patients need treatment: Where's the beef?	80
<b>Carr, J. H. &amp; Shepherd, R. B.</b> "Normal" is not the issue: It is "effective" goal attainment that counts	72	<b>Masters, R. S. W. &amp; Polman, R. C. J.</b> What are "normal movements" in <i>any</i> population?	81
<b>Corcos, D. M., Pfann, K. D. &amp; Buchman, A. S.</b> Defective preprogramming does not account for the clinical deficits of Parkinson's disease	73	<b>Morris, M., Matyas, T., Ianssek, R. &amp; Cunnington, R.</b> Rehabilitation promotes functional movement in atypical populations	82
<b>Gielen, C. C. A. M.</b> "Abnormal" movements: What are they reflections of?	74	<b>Newell, K. M. &amp; Morrison, S.</b> Frames of reference and normal movement	83
<b>Goldberg, G. &amp; Mayer, N. H.</b> The goal of treatment for motor impairment is not to "normalize" but to "functionalize" through facilitative modulation and enabling context	75	<b>Phillips, J. G., Bradshaw, J. L., Slavin, M. J. &amp; Pantelis, C.</b> Abnormal movements can be identified in "atypical" populations	84
<b>Gurd, J. M.</b> Thought is action	76	<b>Scholz, J. P.</b> How functional are atypical motor patterns?	85
<b>Holt, K. G.</b> "Constraint" versus "choice" in preferred movement patterns	76	<b>Sparrow, W. A.</b> What is the appropriate criterion for therapeutic intervention in the motor domain?	86
		<b>Summers, J. J. &amp; Thomas, J.</b> When are adaptive motor patterns nonadaptive?	87

<b>Swinnen, S. P., Verschueren, S. M. P. &amp; Dounskaia, N.</b> Is motor pathology associated with setting new CNS priorities or with increased difficulty in overcoming or suppressing preexisting CNS priorities?	87	<b>Walter, C. B. &amp; Kamm, K.</b> Optimal search strategies for optimal motor solutions: Self-determination or informed guidance?	91
<b>Thelen, E.</b> Developmental "movement disorders" and problem solving	88	<b>Wing, A. M., Kirker, S. &amp; Jenner, J. R.</b> Altered bilateral muscle synergies after stroke	92
<b>Treffner, P. J. &amp; Kelso, J. A. S.</b> Generic mechanism of coordination in special populations	89	<b>Worringham, C. J., Kerr, G. K. &amp; O'Brien, C.</b> Towards functional movement: Implications for research and therapy	92
<b>van Emmerik, R. E. A. &amp; Wagenaar, R. C.</b> On optimality and movement disorders: A dynamic systems perspective	90	<b>Authors' Response</b>	
<b>Wade, M. G. &amp; Guan, J.</b> Anthropomorphizing the CNS: Is it what or who you know?	90	<b>Anson, J. G. &amp; Latash, M. L.</b> Toward peaceful coexistence of adaptive central strategies and medical professionals	94

## **Barresi, J. & Moore, C. Intentional relations and social understanding** **107**

### **Open Peer Commentary**

<b>Allen, C.</b> Comparative cognitive studies, not folk phylogeny, please	122	<b>Hobson, R. P.</b> Understanding minds and selves	132
<b>Baron-Cohen, S.</b> Can children with autism integrate first and third person representations?	123	<b>Mitchell, R. W.</b> Self-knowledge, knowledge of other minds, and kinaesthetic-visual matching	133
<b>Ben Ze'ev, A. &amp; Oatley, K.</b> Development of social emotions and constructive agents	124	<b>Morton, A.</b> But what is the intentional schema?	133
<b>Budwig, N. &amp; Bamberg, M.</b> Language and its role in understanding intentional relations: Research tool or mechanism of development?	125	<b>Nelson, K.</b> Four-year-old humans are different: Why?	134
<b>Church, J.</b> An ambiguity	126	<b>Olson, D. R. &amp; Homer, B.</b> Understanding that looking causes knowing	135
<b>Csibra, G. &amp; Gergely, G.</b> On the dangers of overstimulation	127	<b>Oosterwegel, A.</b> Social relations and understanding the intentional self	136
<b>Dwyer, S.</b> Moral competence is cognitive but (perhaps) nonmodular	128	<b>Povinelli, D. J., Zebouni, M. C. &amp; Prince, C. G.</b> Ontogeny, evolution, and folk psychology	137
<b>Gallup, G. G.</b> Rhesus monkeys are radical behaviorists	129	<b>Premack, D. &amp; Premack, A. J.</b> Intentional schema will not do the work of a theory of mind	138
<b>Gomez, J. C.</b> Second person intentional relations and the evolution of social understanding	129	<b>Reddy, V.</b> Omitting the second person in social understanding	140
<b>Gordon, R. M.</b> First person representations need a methodology based on simulation or theory	130	<b>Slater, C.</b> Are blind babies delayed in achieving social understanding?	141
<b>Heyes, C. M.</b> Imagination and imitation: Input, acid test, or alchemy?	131	<b>Author's Response</b>	
		<b>Barresi, J. &amp; Moore, C.</b> Understanding self and other	142

### **Continuing Commentary**

<b>On Donald, M. (1993) Précis of <i>Origins of the modern mind</i>. BBS 16:737–791.</b>			<b>155</b>
<b>Baum, E. B.</b> Did courtship drive the evolution of the mind?	155	<b>Stenning, K.</b> Episodic is what apes are not	158
<b>Lieberman, P.</b> On Neanderthal speech and human evolution	156	<b>Author's Response</b>	
<b>Olson, D. R.</b> Taxing memory: Writing, memory, and conceptual change	158	<b>Donald, M.</b> The role of vocalization, memory retrieval, and external symbols in cognitive evolution	159