

# *THE REVIEW OF POLITICS*

University of Notre Dame  
Fall 1989

# THE REVIEW OF POLITICS

*Editor*

**DONALD P. KOMMERS**

*Managing Editor*

**DENNIS WM MORAN**

*Book Review Editor*

**WALTER NICGORSKI**

*Associate Editors*

**Philip Gleason**  
**E. A. Goerner**

**Thomas Stritch**  
**Thomas Werge**

*Former Editors*

**Waldemar Gurian**  
**M. A. Fitzsimons**

**Thomas Stritch**  
**Frederick J. Crosson**

*Editorial Advisory Board*

**Henry J. Abraham**  
*University of Virginia*  
**Charles W. Anderson**  
*University of Wisconsin-Madison*

**J. David Greenstone**  
*University of Chicago*  
**Arend Lijphart**  
*University of California-San Diego*  
**Alasdair MacIntyre**  
*University of Notre Dame*  
**Harvey C. Mansfield, Jr.**  
*Harvard University*

**Shlomo Avineri**  
*Hebrew University of Jerusalem*  
**Robert F. Byrnes**  
*Indiana University*  
**Ernest L. Fortin**  
*Boston College*  
**Gerald Garvey**  
*Princeton University*  
**Penny T. Gill**  
*Mount Holyoke College*

**John R. Schmidhauser**  
*University of Southern California*  
**Kenneth W. Thompson**  
*University of Virginia*  
**Glenn Tinder**  
*University of Massachusetts-Boston*

*Editorial Intern*

**Alan Gibson**

---

THE REVIEW OF POLITICS, without neglecting the analysis of institutions and techniques, is primarily interested in the philosophical and historical approach to political realities.

The articles in THE REVIEW OF POLITICS are indexed in the International Index to Periodicals and the Index of Catholic Periodicals and abstracted in the International Political Science Abstracts. They are abstracted and indexed in ABC POL. SCI. and HISTORICAL ABSTRACTS and SOCIAL SCIENCES INDEX.

---

THE REVIEW OF POLITICS (ISSN 0034-6705) is published quarterly for \$25.00 per year in the United States (Individual, \$20.00); foreign \$28.00 (Individual \$23.00); single copies, \$6.25 (domestic) and \$7.00 (foreign) by The University of Notre Dame, P.O. Box B, Notre Dame, IN 46556. Second-class postage paid at Notre Dame, IN. POSTMASTER: Send address changes to THE REVIEW OF POLITICS, P.O. Box B, Notre Dame, IN 46556.

# THE REVIEW OF POLITICS

Published Quarterly by the University of Notre Dame, Indiana

---

Vol. 51

Fall 1989

No. 4

---

MICHAEL J. PERRY

Neutral Politics? ..... 479

MATTHEW J. FRANCK

Statesmanship and the Judiciary ..... 510

ROBERT B. THIGPEN AND LYLE A. DOWNING

Liberal and Communitarian Approaches to Justification .. 533

LEONARD R. SORENSON

The Limits of Constitutional Government: Reflections  
toward the Conclusion of the Bicentennial Celebration of  
Our Constitution ..... 551

RUSSELL NIELI

Commercial Society and Christian Virtue: The  
Mandeville—Law Dispute ..... 581

*Reviews:*

Thomas Engeman: *Explication de Constitution* ..... 612

James L. Curtis: *Perspectives on the Constitutional Convention* ..... 613

David Fellman: *Hugo Black as Polestar* ..... 615

James Tunstead Burtchaeil, C.S.C.: *The Right to Life and the Liberal  
Tradition* ..... 618

Timothy Fuller: *Hobbes: Champion of the Ordinary Citizen* ..... 620

Peter Berkowitz: *Reconstructing Nietzsche as Progressive* ..... 623

Bernard P. Dauenhauer: *Phases of Merleau-Ponty's Political Philosophy* ..... 628

Edward Andrew: *Simone Weil: The Difficulty of Seeing Her Clearly* ..... 631

John A. Gueguen: *Appreciating Gerhart Niemeyer* ..... 635

H. Mark Roelofs: *Socialism and Christianity* ..... 638

David G. Skidmore II: *Coping with Decline* ..... 640

David Clay Large: *Confronting the Past* ..... 644

## Contributors to This Issue

MICHAEL J. PERRY is Professor of Law in the Northwestern University School of Law. MATTHEW J. FRANK is Instructor of Political Science in Radford University. ROBERT B. THIGPEN and LYLE A. DOWNING are both members of the Political Science Department of the University of New Orleans, New Orleans. LEONARD R. SORENSON is Assistant Professor of Politics in Assumption College. RUSSELL NIELI is a member of the Department of Politics in Princeton University.

THOMAS ENGEMAN, a member of Loyola's Political Science Department, is currently teaching in Loyola's Rome Program. JAMES L. CURTIS teaches political science in Pennsylvania State University. DAVID FELLMAN is Professor Emeritus of Political Science in the University of Wisconsin-Madison. JAMES TUNSTEAD BURTCHAELL, C.S.C., whose *The Giving and Taking of Life* was published in 1989, is Professor of Theology at Notre Dame. TIMOTHY FULLER, Professor of Political Science in Colorado College, is Editor of the *International Hobbes Association Newsletter*. PETER BERKOWITZ, Assistant Professor of Government in Harvard University, is the winner of 1988 APSA Leo Strauss Prize for his dissertation, "The Foundations of Nietzsche's Political Philosophy." BERNARD P. DAUENHAUER is Professor of Philosophy in the University of Georgia. EDWARD ANDREW is Professor of Political Science in the University of Toronto. JOHN A. GUEGUEN teaches political philosophy at Illinois State University. DAVID G. SKIDMORE II is Assistant Professor of Political Science in Drake University. DAVID CLAY LARGE is Associate Professor of History in Montana State University, Bozeman.

---

### INSTRUCTIONS TO CONTRIBUTORS

All manuscripts should be submitted in QUADRUPLICATE to *The Review of Politics*, Box B, Notre Dame, IN 46556. If the return of the manuscript is desired, a stamped, self-addressed envelope should be enclosed. All typewritten material should be double-spaced, including notes and quotations; photocopies of a good quality are acceptable. *The Review* follows the *Chicago Manual of Style* for standards of citation, punctuation and other editorial considerations. The normal length of manuscripts published is 25-30 pages. Longer manuscripts will be evaluated in light of the limited printing space available. Since manuscripts are evaluated anonymously they should not bear the author's name or institutional affiliation. Submissions should be sent with an ABSTRACT of 100-150 words. All correspondence regarding book reviews should be sent to Mr. Walter Nicgorski at the above address.