# A re-examination of the effect of vitamin $B_{12}$ concentrate on the hepatic injury produced by carbon tetrachloride

## BY K. ATERMAN\* AND D. DARLINGTON

## Department of Anatomy, Medical School, University of Birmingham

#### (Received 19 August 1958—Revised 24 November 1958)

It has been stated that the damaging effect of carbon tetrachloride (CCl<sub>4</sub>) on the liver of rats—as measured by the degree of bromsulphalein retention, the increase in the level of liver fat, and the histologically demonstrable liver-cell damage—can to some extent be inhibited by the administration of vitamin  $B_{12}$  given in relatively large doses for a few days before the injection of a single dose of CCl<sub>4</sub> (Popper, Koch-Weser & Szanto, 1949; Koch-Weser, Szanto, Farber & Popper, 1950; Popper & Schaffner, 1957). Vitamin  $B_{12}$  is even stated to increase the amount of CCl<sub>4</sub>, given in a single dose, that can be tolerated by a rat (Koch-Weser *et al.* 1950). Some of these findings have been confirmed by other workers. Hove & Hardin (1950), for instance, have concluded that 'vitamin  $B_{12}$  afforded some protection against carbon tetrachloride'. Similarly, Mushett (1950) has reported a protective effect of vitamin  $B_{12}$  against the '...fatty metamorphosis, the hydropic change and the depletion of cytoplasmic ribonucleic acid...' caused by a single dose of CCl<sub>4</sub>, but he also noted that vitamin  $B_{12}$ increased the size of the liver and the degree of fatty change when CCl<sub>4</sub> was given over a more prolonged period.

More recently Wolff (1957), in his review of the part played by the liver in the metabolism of vitamin  $B_{12}$ , has, on the basis of a very small series of experiments, accepted the inhibitory action of vitamin B<sub>12</sub> on the hepatotoxic effects of CCl<sub>4</sub> as first claimed by Popper and his associates. This claim has also been accepted by several other workers, for instance by Vorhaus & Vorhaus (1954), and has even led to the therapeutic use of vitamin B<sub>12</sub> in disorders of the liver (for instance by Campbell & Pruitt, 1955). There is, however, little experimental evidence that vitamin  $B_{12}$  exerts a protective effect against other hepatotoxic agents such as, for instance, selenium (Rigdon, Couch, Brashear & Qureshi, 1955). On the other hand, Wachter (1955), who used different criteria, has concluded that vitamin B<sub>12</sub> has no effect on the liver damage caused by  $CCl_4$ . Attempts to demonstrate in vitro an effect of vitamin  $B_{12}$ on some of the enzyme systems of the liver of normal rats, and of rats treated with CCl4, have also not been successful (Rahman & Ahmad, 1955). It may be of interest in this connexion to point out that no satisfactory explanation of the inhibitory effect of vitamin B<sub>12</sub> on the hepatotoxic action of CCl<sub>4</sub> has been advanced, even by those workers who have reported it. According to Popper et al. (1949) a primary lipotropic effect of vitamin B<sub>12</sub> cannot be invoked, because it is only seen in animals fed on a diet low in protein. These workers at first supposed that vitamin B<sub>12</sub> influenced the

\* Present address: Department of Pathology, Dalhousie University, Halifax, Nova Scotia.

metabolism of nucleic acids, but abandoned this view later in favour of a possible vasodilatory effect of the vitamin (Koch-Weser *et al.* 1950).

A proper understanding of the inhibitory effect of vitamin  $B_{12}$  on the damaging effects of  $CCl_4$  might conceivably throw some light on the mode of action of one of the most widely used hepatotoxic agents; it was, therefore, thought of interest to reexamine the question. In view of the statement of Meites (1952) and Meites, Feng & Wilwerth (1957) that the requirements for vitamin  $B_{12}$  are increased by the administration of cortisone to experimental animals, the possibility was also considered that any differences caused by the administration, or lack, of vitamin  $B_{12}$  might be accentuated by simultaneous treatment with cortisone.

### EXPERIMENTAL

Animals and their treatment. Male rats of a strain bred in the Department of Anatomy, Birmingham, numbering 235, were used. Their body-weights ranged from 105 to 250 g, but this variation was largely offset by the litter-mate arrangement used

Table 1. Stock rat-cake diet and protein-free diet (Kosterlitz, 1947) given to the rats

iet (Expt	1, values as percentages)	
17.7	Meat-and-bone meal	8.8
17.9	White fish meal	4.2
17.7	Dried yeast	1.5
14.0	Cod-liver oil	
	Salt	<b>o</b> ·4
Protein-fr	ee diet (Expt 2)	
2	Pyroxidine ( $\mu g/10 g$ )	30
6	Riboflavin ( $\mu g/10 g$ )	50
64	Calcium D-panthothenate ( $\mu$ g/10 g)	100
25	Nicotinic acid ( $\mu g/10 g$ )	100
3	Inositol (mg/10 g)	1
30	Choline chloride (mg/10 g)	17.3
	iet (Expt 17·7 17·9 17·7 14·0 Protein-fr 2 6 64 25 3 30	iet (Expt 1, values as percentages) 17.7 Meat-and-bone meal 17.9 White fish meal 17.7 Dried yeast 14.0 Cod-liver oil Salt Protein-free diet (Expt 2) 2 Pyroxidine ( $\mu g/10 g$ ) 6 Riboflavin ( $\mu g/10 g$ ) 64 Calcium D-panthothenate ( $\mu g/10 g$ ) 25 Nicotinic acid ( $\mu g/10 g$ ) 3 Inositol (mg/10 g) 30 Choline chloride (mg/10 g)

throughout the experiment. It consisted in comparing in each group brothers only, so that the effect of each factor examined could be checked in brothers treated with another factor or not treated at all. With, for instance, four litter-mates it was thus possible to compare the effect of  $CCl_4$  with or without vitamin  $B_{12}$  in rats also given injections of cortisone. Two major experiments were done; they differed only in the diet (Table 1) given to the animals. In Expt 1 the rats were fed on the stock rat-cake diet, but in Expt 2 they were given for 7 days a diet similar to the protein-free diet of Kosterlitz (1947) before being treated with  $CCl_4$  by either subcutaneous or intraperitoneal injection. The subcutaneous dose of  $CCl_4$  was always 0.15 ml/100 g body-weight, and one, four or twelve injections at intervals of 3 days were given to the animals on the normal diet. Some animals of the last two groups were also given a total dose of 97.5 mg cortisone acetate (Cortone, Merck and Co. Ltd) for the last 10 days of the experiment. Rats fed on the protein-free diet received only a single subcutaneous injection of  $CCl_4$ . Other groups of rats, in both major experiments, were given a single intraperitoneal injection of either 0.03, 0.2 or 0.4 ml CCl<sub>4</sub> in mineral oil

per 100 g body-weight, as reported by Koch-Weser et al. (1950). Half the animals in each group of both major experiments were, in addition, treated with vitamin  $B_{12}$ concentrate (Cytamen, Glaxo Laboratories Ltd) in a dose of 10-30  $\mu$ g/100 g bodyweight. It was given either in four or, with the multiple injections of CCl<sub>4</sub>, ten consecutive daily injections, in such a manner that the last injection of vitamin  $B_{12}$ always coincided with the last or the only injection of CCl<sub>4</sub>. Most animals were allowed free access to food throughout the experiment, but some were fasted for 19-24 h before being killed by bleeding under light ether anaesthesia. Rats given the larger, lethal, intraperitoneal injections of CCl4 (0.4 ml) were allowed to die spontaneously, and the time of death was recorded as nearly as possible for a study of the survival times (Table 4). The livers of animals that had been killed were quickly removed, weighed, frozen in liquid nitrogen, and stored at  $-30^{\circ}$ , or immediately dried. Residual moisture after preliminary drying was removed by heating and drying to constant weight under reduced pressure over phosphorus pentoxide, and the water content was taken as the difference between the wet and the dry liver weight. Lipids were extracted from the dry residue by a hot mixture of 2 parts methanol and I part chloroform, and the percentage of fat was calculated from the difference between the dry weight and the weight of the fat-free residue.

Histological examination. Small specimens of the liver were fixed by the method of freezing and drying of Altmann-Gersh (Gersh, 1948) or, in a few instances, by immersion in Bouin's alcoholic fluid. Sections were stained with haematoxylin-eosin for a general survey, with the Hotchkiss-McManus Periodic Acid Schiff (PAS) reagent for polysaccharides, and, sometimes, with toluidine blue or methyl green-pyronin for nucleic acids. Some sections were also stained with iron haematoxylin for mitochondria.

Statistical treatment. The statistical methods used in the analysis of these experiments require some comment. Since litter-mate arrangements were used in the designs of most of the experiments, it was necessary to equalize the numbers of animals in each treatment group. Unequal numbers arose either through extra littermates being included or through animals dying before the end of the experiments. Excess animals in any litter were discarded, the choice of these animals being made in a random manner. Litters without representatives in more than half the treatment groups were also discarded. When any of the remaining litters were incomplete the statistical analysis was adjusted appropriately. The number of animals used in the tables presented here relates therefore only to the numbers of animals used for statistical analysis, although the total number of animals whose livers were examined was somewhat larger.

The values for times of survival were analysed by a method suggested to us by Dr M. R. Sampford to whom we are indebted.

#### RESULTS

## Expt 1. Effect of carbon tetrachloride with and without vitamin $B_{12}$ concentrate on the liver of rats given the normal diet

After the injection of single or repeated doses of  $CCl_4$ , certain characteristic changes take place in the liver which can range, briefly, from fatty changes and loss of nucleic

## Vol. 13 Vitamin $B_{12}$ and carbon tetrachloride

171

acids and of glycogen to necrosis and 'hydropic degeneration' or 'ballooning' of the liver cell. Since these changes have been described in detail by many workers (for literature see, for instance, Drill, 1952), a further enumeration here is not necessary. It will be sufficient to draw attention briefly to the difficulty encountered in comparing the damage caused by  $CCl_4$  in individual animals, since it is well known that there is considerable variation in response. The litter-mate arrangement chosen for these experiments to some extent reduced this difficulty. The histological features found most useful for comparative purposes of the type studied here were the extent of 'hydropic degeneration' of the liver cell and the degree of glycogen depletion in the rats with free access to food. Goldschmidt, Vars & Ravdin (1939) have suggested that the loss of glycogen from the liver of animals treated with chloroform can best be explained by the inability of the damaged liver cells to retain glycogen. It is probable that this explanation also holds for the liver-cell damage by  $CCl_4$ . Since the method of fixation by freezing and drying used by us is the method of choice for the histo-

Table 2. Mean values with their standard errors for the fat content of the liver of normal rats fed or fasted for 24 h, showing lack of effect of fasting

		Mean fat content (as percentage of
Treatment	No. of animals	wet weight)
Fed	16	4·87±0·145
Fasted	13	4·99±0·379

chemical demonstration of glycogen, making it possible to detect relatively small changes in the amount and distribution of that substance by means of the PAS method (Aterman, 1952), a fairly reliable estimate of the degree of liver damage caused by  $CCl_4$  could be obtained. When glycogen had been depleted by a preceding fast, attention was also paid to the degree of eosinophilia of the hepatocellular cytoplasm, and to the behaviour of the 'basophile inclusion bodies' of the liver cells.

When these histological criteria were applied to liver sections from rats treated with carbon tetrachloride little, if any, difference could be seen in either the acutely or the subacutely poisoned animals by comparison with their litter-mates treated with vitamin B<sub>12</sub> as well. The failure of vitamin B<sub>12</sub> to inhibit the histological manifestations of damage by  $CCl_4$  was seen in fasted as well as in fed rats, and is borne out by a study of the level of hepatic lipids, and of the survival time of the rats. It can be seen from Tables 2 and 3 that, in fed or fasted rats, treatment with vitamin  $B_{12}$  did not significantly alter the degree of fatty change that follows a single or repeated injection of CCl<sub>4</sub>. Also, the administration of cortisone made little difference to the failure of vitamin B<sub>12</sub> to affect the course of poisoning with CCl<sub>4</sub>. This failure of vitamin B<sub>12</sub> was also seen when the absolute or relative liver weights were compared, or when the survival time of those rats given intraperitoneal injections of a single toxic dose of CCl<sub>4</sub> was studied (Table 4). Although a preliminary experiment had suggested (Table 4, A) that vitamin  $B_{12}$  given before treatment with  $CCl_4$  might have a slight delaying effect in these animals, a second, larger experiment (Table 4, B) did not bear out this possibility.

Table 3.	Expt 1.	Effect of	one, four	or twelve	injection	s of carl	on tetrac	hloride (	o∙15 ml/
100	g body-u	veight) alo	ne or with	vitamin	$B_{12}$ (15)	µg/100 g	body-we	ight) or c	ortisone
(97	5 mg) or	both on th	he fat cont	ent of th	e liver of	<sup>c</sup> rats, ex	pressed a	s a perce	ntage of
the	wet weigi	ht							

Treat- ment	No. of animals	Doses of CCl4	Vitamin B <sub>12</sub>	Cortisone	Mean fat content	Error mean square	d.f.
Fed	7	o	N.G.	N.G.	4.77*	-	
	13 13	I I	N.G. G.	N.G. N.G.	5·72) 5·20)	1.03	12
Fasted	7 8 9	O I I	N.G. N.G. G.	N.G. N.G. N.G.	$5.14 \\ 5.69 \\ 5.13 $	0.82	13
	7 7 5 7	4 4 4	N.G. G. N.G. G	N.G. N.G. G. G.	7·92 8·81 6·67 8·54	5.28	16
	9 9 8 8	12 12 12 12	N.G. G. N.G. G.	N.G. N.G. G. G.	7·36 7·62 5·80 5·37	3.75	22

G., given; N.G., not given.

\* Standard error of the mean = 0.25.

Table 4. Expt 1. Effect of vitamin  $B_{12}$  injection (30  $\mu g/100$  g body-weight) on the survival time of litter-mate rats fed on a normal diet and given a single intraperitoneal injection of carbon tetrachloride (0.4 ml/100 g body-weight)

		No. found dead at							No. that	
ר	Freatment	0-4 h	4–8 h	8–12 hr	12–16 h	16-20 h	20–24 h	24–36 h	36-48 h	48 h
- (	CCl <sub>4</sub>	6	2	o	0	0	o	2	o	0
$A \left\{ \right.$	CCl <sub>4</sub> and vitamin B <sub>12</sub>	0	4	2	3	0	0	I	o	0
1	(CCl <sub>4</sub>	I	6	8	I	0	o	I	o	3
B	CCl <sub>4</sub> and vitamin B <sub>12</sub>	3	3	7	3	o	0	I	I	2

## Expt 2. Effect of $CCl_4$ with and without vitamin $B_{12}$ concentrate on the liver of rats given the protein-deficient diet

Thus, on the one hand, we have the failure of vitamin  $B_{12}$  to influence the damage caused by  $CCl_4$  in the normal rats of our experiments; on the other is the statement by Popper *et al.* (1949) and Koch-Weser *et al.* (1950) that the inhibitory effect of vitamin  $B_{12}$  reported by them could not be attributed to a sparing action of vitamin  $B_{12}$  on lipotropic agents such as choline, since this effect was only seen in animals fed on a diet deficient in protein. These findings suggested a study of the effect of vitamin  $B_{12}$  on the course of poisoning by  $CCl_4$  in rats fed on such a diet. But first the possibility had to be considered that the discrepancy between the findings presented here and those of Popper and his associates could perhaps be attributed to some defect in the preparation of vitamin  $B_{12}$  used. An assay of the preparation, undertaken after the results of Expt 1 had been analysed, had shown it to be fully active. (We are indebted to Glaxo Laboratories Ltd for this information.) It was, therefore, necessary to establish whether the inhibitory effect of vitamin B<sub>12</sub>, claimed by Popper's group, could be demonstrated in rats depleted of protein by ingestion of a protein-free diet for 7 days before treatment with CCl<sub>4</sub>. Here, however, the difficulty is encountered that the depletion of protein produces, by itself, certain characteristic changes in the liver cell which have to be considered before the effect of CCl<sub>4</sub> can be fully assessed. Such changes were first noted by Afanassiew (1883), but have more recently been studied in greater detail by Elman, Smith & Sachar (1943), Wang, Hegsted, Lapi, Zamcheck & Black (1949) and, particularly, by Kosterlitz (1947). Histologically, the liver cells assume a peculiar rarefied appearance which has led several authors to speak of 'plant-like' or even 'hydropically changed' cells. They are of normal, or smaller than normal, size with an apparently normal nucleus and prominent nucleolus. Clumps of cytoplasm are clustered around the nucleus and pressed against the periphery of the cells. As a result of this distribution of the stainable cytoplasm, the liver cells depleted of protein, in contrast to normal cells, appear to have in freeze-dried sections a distinct cellular membrane. The cell body contains, in sections stained with haematoxylineosin, irregular 'empty' spaces which can easily be mistaken for vacuoles but which, on staining with Best's carmine or with the PAS reagents, can be shown to contain ample amounts of glycogen. It is the formation of these spaces that gives the liver cell of the animal depleted in protein its characteristic rarefied appearance. Although there exists a certain superficial resemblance between this change and the 'ballooning' of the liver cells caused by CCl4-the term 'hydropic change' has indeed been applied by different workers to both these phenomena-these changes are easily distinguishable. Not only does almost every cell in the liver lobule show this 'plantlike' appearance, in contrast to the limited number of cells showing the true 'hydropic change' caused by CCl4, but also there is the presence of glycogen in the 'plant-like' cells, in contrast to its invariable absence in the true 'hydropic' change. The morphological changes, briefly outlined here, are always accompanied by certain biochemical changes in the composition of the liver cells. These have been summarized by Kosterlitz (1947) as a loss of 'labile cytoplasm'. Of interest for the purpose of the present paper is the fact that the fat content of the liver of animals fed on a diet deficient in protein can increase in comparison with that of normal controls (Kosterlitz, 1947; Best, Hartroft, Lucas & Ridout, 1955; Johnson, Firth & Mistry, 1955). A slight increase in the mean fat content was indeed seen in the untreated rats given the protein-free diet (Table 5) but it was not statistically significant. After the injection of  $CCl_4$  a significant (P < 0.001) further increase in the level of lipids in the liver took place. Treatment with vitamin B<sub>12</sub> before the administration of CCl<sub>4</sub> reduced this rise in the amount of fat present in the liver which, however, still remained at a higher level than in the untreated litter-mates fed on the protein-free diet. Although statistically this reduction was only significant at the 5 % level, it would seem that in the rat fed on the protein-free diet and treated with CCl<sub>4</sub> vitamin B<sub>12</sub> may have some lipotropic effect, in contrast to its ineffectiveness in the rat fed on a normal diet.

1959

https://doi.org/10.1079/BJN19590024 Published online by Cambridge University Press

Histological examination, however, showed that the slight lipotropic action of vitamin  $B_{12}$  in these animals was not accompanied by any corresponding inhibitory effect against the other manifestations of poisoning with CCl<sub>4</sub>. Neither the degree of glycogen depletion nor the other cytological criteria used were significantly influenced by the prior administration of vitamin  $B_{12}$ . This finding is the more significant as the histological changes caused by CCl<sub>4</sub> in these animals were considerably less pronounced than in the rats fed on the normal diet and treated with approximately the same dose of CCl<sub>4</sub>. Hydropic degeneration or 'ballooning', for instance, was only rarely seen and, if present, tended to occur more in isolated cells than in clusters and rows, as in the rat fed on the normal diet. The failure of vitamin  $B_{12}$  to alter materially the course of poisoning with CCl<sub>4</sub> was also clearly demonstrated by its lack of effect on the survival time of rats given a single toxic (0·4 ml) dose of CCl<sub>4</sub> intraperitoneally (Table 6).

Table 5. Expt 2. Effect of a single subcutaneous dose of carbon tetrachloride (0.15 ml/ 100 g body-weight) with and without vitamin  $B_{12}$  (15  $\mu$ g/100 g body-weight) on the fat content of the liver of rats fed on a protein-free diet, expressed as a percentage of the wet weight

Treatment	No. of	Mean	Significance of difference
	animals	fat content	between adjacent rows
Normal diet Protein-free diet Protein-free diet; CCl <sub>4</sub> Protein-free diet; CCl <sub>4</sub> and vitamin B <sub>12</sub>	8 13 13 12	4·99 5·39 6·83 6·06	$\begin{array}{l} 0.4 > P > 0.3 \\ 0.001 > P \\ 0.05 > P > 0.02 \end{array}$

Error mean square 0.85; d.f. = 30.

Table 6. Expt 2. Effect of vitamin  $B_{12}$  injection (30  $\mu g/100 g$  body-weight) on the survival time of rats fed on a protein-free diet and given a single intraperitoneal injection of carbon tetrachloride (0.4 ml/100 g body-weight)

	No. found dead at								No. that	
Treatment	0-4 h	- 4-8 h	8-12 h	12–16 h	16–20 h	20–24 h	24–36 h	36-48 h	48 h	
CCl <sub>4</sub>	0	2	2	I	I	0	0	0	I	
$CCl_4$ and vitamin $B_{12}$	I	I	2	I	I	٥	I	٥	0	

The findings so far presented suggested the possibility that the partial inhibitory effect of vitamin  $B_{12}$  seen here was not a real inhibitory effect as far as the hepatotoxic action of CCl<sub>4</sub> was concerned, but that it was more likely to be an expression of the primary lipotropic effect of vitamin  $B_{12}$  postulated in the literature and dismissed by Popper *et al.* (1949) as an explanation of their findings. This possibility was tested by studying the effect of vitamin  $B_{12}$  alone, without the simultaneous treatment with CCl<sub>4</sub>, in rats fed on the protein-free diet. It can be seen from Table 7 that treatment with vitamin  $B_{12}$  alone produced a slight, but fairly consistent, decrease in the fat content of the liver (0.05 > P > 0.02). This finding, in conjunction with the other observations reported here and in the literature, lends some support to the view that

## Vol. 13 Vitamin $B_{12}$ and carbon tetrachloride

https://doi.org/10.1079/BJN19590024 Published online by Cambridge University Press

under the conditions of this experiment any inhibitory effect of vitamin  $B_{12}$  need not necessarily be attributed to its effect on the hepatotoxic action of  $CCl_4$ .

Table 7. Expt 2. Effect of vitamin  $B_{12}$  injection (15  $\mu g/100 g$  body-weight) on the fat content of the liver of litter-mate rats fed on a protein-free diet, expressed as a percentage of the wet weight

Protein-free diet	Protein-free diet vitamin B <sub>12</sub>	; Difference
4.90	4.13	0.22
5.24	4.26	o·98
5.32	4.91	0.41
4.53	4'37	0.14
5.60	4.42	1.18
4.82	4.42	0.32
Mean 5.01	4.42	$0.59 \pm 0.196$ (0.05 > P > 0.02)

#### DISCUSSION

The findings presented here are at variance with those reported by Popper et al. (1949). It is, of course, always possible that variations in the experimental conditions, such as differences in the strain and sex of the rats used, could account for this discrepancy. Attention should, on the other hand, be drawn to the fact that a satisfactory explanation of the postulated inhibitory effect of vitamin B<sub>12</sub> has so far not been advanced. It is, indeed, difficult to understand why animals fed on an adequate diet should respond favourably to the administration of an excess of this vitamin. A cursory attempt to find other instances of a favourable effect of vitamin B<sub>12</sub> in animals fed on a more or less adequate diet has so far not been successful. Rigdon et al. (1955), for instance, found no effect of vitamin B<sub>12</sub> on the hepatic necrosis caused by the ingestion of selenium. Similarly, Arrigo & Montini (1950) were not able to detect any effect of vitamin  $B_{12}$  on the fatty changes in the liver after partial hepatectomy, and no effect was seen in the present experiments on the loss of body-weight and on the level of hepatic lipids of rats treated with CCl<sub>4</sub> and given cortisone at the same time. The lipotropic effect of vitamin B<sub>12</sub> is on occasion even missing with diets that cannot be considered to be nutritionally adequate. This question has been discussed by Shils, De Giovanni & Stewart (1955). Lipotropic effects of vitamin  $B_{12}$  have, on the other hand, been reported with experimental diets clearly deficient in vitamin B<sub>12</sub>. This is, presumably, the explanation of the changes reported by Hedin & Schultze (1955), as well as of those found in our experiments. To some extent the discrepancy between the findings reported here and the results of the other workers quoted above is reminiscent of the controversy concerning the favourable effects of supplements of vitamin  $B_{12}$  in clinical nutrition. Whereas early reports had suggested that treatment of children with vitamin B<sub>12</sub> improved their nutritional status (Wetzel, Fargo, Smith & Helikson, 1949), some later reports failed to confirm this finding (Benjamin & Pirrie, 1952). It has been suggested that this occasional lack of a favourable effect could be explained by the absence of a significant deficiency of this vitamin (Pink & Wokes, 1952; Wokes & Picard, 1955) and that, indeed, in the absence of such a deficiency a favourable effect of supplements of vitamin  $B_{12}$  could not be reasonably

expected (Howe, 1958). This conclusion could equally well be applied to our results and may, perhaps, explain the discrepancy between them and those of Popper and his associates. These workers, however, have been careful to stress that a vitamin effect was unlikely since the doses of vitamin  $B_{12}$  used in their experiments were 'pharmacological'. But whatever the explanation of the reported lipotropic effect of vitamin  $B_{12}$  may be, our findings also suggest that this action is not synonymous with an 'inhibition' of the hepatotoxic functions of  $CCl_4$ . Despite a slight lowering action on the level of liver lipids in the protein-depleted rats, vitamin  $B_{12}$  has no significant effect on either the histological picture of the liver or the survival time of rats treated with  $CCl_4$ . In the absence of further evidence, the inhibitory effect of vitamin  $B_{12}$  on the hepatotoxic action of  $CCl_4$ , as opposed to its possible lipotropic effect, can therefore not be considered to have been proved beyond doubt. Further experiments are needed.

The difference in the histological picture after treatment with CCl<sub>4</sub>, in the rats fed on the normal diet and in those fed on the diet free of protein, was pronounced. The dependence of the effect of hepatotoxic agents on dietary factors is well known. For some time it had been considered that a high content of glycogen in the liver exerted some protective effect, but Goldschmidt et al. (1939) have maintained that, at least as far as the effects of chloroform are concerned, protein in the diet 'decidedly decreases' the degree of hepatic injury. Similarly, Miller, Ross & Whipple (1940) have reported a protective effect of cystine given to dogs depleted of protein. From these and related observations one would have expected to find in our experiments a greater degree of liver damage in the rats fed on the protein-free diet than in those fed on the normal diet, but it was not found. Similar results have been reported by Campbell & Kosterlitz (1948), and by Drill (1952), who has published a detailed review of the part played by dietary factors in the injury produced by hepatotoxic agents. According to this worker the best protection against such liver damage is offered by diets rich in carbohydrates. At a constant dietary level of fat, damage was greater in animals fed on a diet with a 'normal' content of protein than in animals fed on a diet low in protein but high in carbohydrate. The nature of this protective effect of diets low in protein is not well understood and deserves further investigation, particularly with regard to changes in liver function which have so far received only comparatively little attention.

#### SUMMARY

1. Male rats, fed on a normal or a protein-deficient diet, were treated with single or with multiple injections of carbon tetrachloride. Their litter-mates were also given injections of vitamin  $B_{12}$ , and the effect of this treatment on the hepatotoxic actions of  $CCl_4$  was studied, since a protective action of this vitamin has been claimed by some workers.

2. In contrast to these reports in the literature, vitamin  $B_{12}$  was found to have no effect on the histological picture, the fat content, or the survival time of acutely poisoned rats fed on a normal diet.

3. In rats fed on a protein-free diet for some days before injection of a single dose of  $CCl_4$ , vitamin  $B_{12}$  produced a slight decrease in the level of lipids in the liver, but

1959

177

## Vol. 13

had no effect on the histological picture, or on the survival time after treatment with toxic doses of CCl<sub>4</sub>.

4. Since vitamin B<sub>12</sub> also exerted a slight 'lipotropic' effect in rats given only the protein-free diet, but not treated with CCl<sub>4</sub>, a distinction has to be made between the 'lipotropic' action of vitamin B<sub>12</sub> and the alleged inhibitory action on the hepatotoxic effect of CCl<sub>4</sub>.

5. The difference in response seen in the normal and in the protein-depleted rat is compared to the differences reported in the response of children given supplements of vitamin B<sub>12</sub>, which have been attributed by some workers to the alleviation of a deficiency of that vitamin.

Our thanks are due to Glaxo Laboratories Ltd for the gift of vitamin  $B_{12}$ , to Roche Products Ltd for the vitamins used in the protein-free diet, and to Merck and Co. Ltd for the cortisone acetate. The technical assistance of Miss H. Sorrill and Mrs D. Baker is gratefully acknowledged.

#### REFERENCES

- Afanassiew, M. (1883). Arch. Physiol. 30, 385.
- Arrigo, L. A. & Montini, T. (1950). Boll. Soc. Ital. Biol. sper. 26, 1339.
- Aterman, K. (1952). Arch. Path. 53, 197.
- Benjamin, B. & Pirrie, G. D. (1952). Lancet, 262, 264.
- Best, C. H., Hartroft, W. S., Lucas, C. C. & Ridout, J. H. (1955). Brit. med. J. i, 1439.
- Campbell, R. M. & Kosterlitz, H. W. (1948). Brit. J. exp. Path. 29, 149.
- Campbell, R. E. & Pruitt, F. W. (1955). Amer. J. med. Sci. 229, 8.
- Drill, V. A. (1952). Pharm. Rev. 4, 1.
- Elman, R., Smith, M. G. & Sachar, L. A. (1943). Gastroenterology, 1, 24.
- Gersh, I. (1948). Bull. int. Ass. med. Mus. 28, 179.
- Goldschmidt, S., Vars, H. M. & Ravdin, I. S. (1939). J. clin. Invest. 18, 277.
- Hedin, P. A. & Schultze, M. O. (1955). J. Nutr. 56, 129.
- Hove, E. L. & Hardin, J. O. (1950). Fed. Proc. 9, 362.
- Howe, E. E. (1958). Amer. J. clin. Nutr. 6, 18.
- Johnson, B. C., Firth, J. & Mistry, S. P. (1955). Arch. Biochem. Biophys. 54, 467.
- Koch-Weser, D., Szanto, P. B., Farber, E. & Popper, H. (1950). J. Lab. clin. Med. 36, 694.
- Kosterlitz, H. W. (1947). J. Physiol. 106, 194.
- Meites, J. (1952). Metabolism, 1, 58.
- Meites, J., Feng, Y. S. L. & Wilwerth, A. M. (1957). Amer. J. clin. Nutr. 5, 381.
- Miller, L. L., Ross, F. J. & Whipple, G. H. (1940) Amer. J. med. Sci. 200, 739.
- Mushett, C. W. (1950). Fed. Proc. 9, 339.
- Pink, C. V. & Wokes, F. (1952). Lancet, 263, 1274.
- Popper, H., Koch-Weser, D. & Szanto, P. B. (1949). Proc. Soc. exp. Biol., N.Y., 71, 688.
- Popper, H. & Schaffner, F. S. (1957). Liver Structure and Function, p. 58. New York: McGraw Hill Co.
- Rahman, M. M. & Ahmad, K. (1955). Ann. Biochem. 15, 143.
- Rigdon, R. H., Couch, J. R., Brashear, D. & Qureshi, R. T. (1955). Arch. Path. 59, 66.
- Shils, M. E., De Giovanni, R. & Stewart, W. B. (1955). J. Nutr. 56, 95.
- Vorhaus, E. F. & Vorhaus, L. F. (1954). Gastroenterology, 26, 887.
- Wachter, H. P. (1955). Acta Hepatol. 3, 88.
- Wang, C. F., Hegsted, D. M., Lapi, A., Zamcheck, N. & Black, M. B. (1949). J. Lab. clin. Med. 34, 953.
- Wetzel, N. C., Fargo, W. C., Smith, I. H. & Helikson, J. (1949). Science, 110, 651. Wokes, F. & Picard, C. W. (1955). Amer. J. clin. Nutr. 3, 383.
- Wolff, R. (1957). In Vitamin B<sub>12</sub> und Intrinsic Factor. 1. Europäisches Symposion, Hamburg, 1956, p. 519. [H. C. Heinrich, editor.] Stuttgart: F. Enke Verlag.