

VOLUME 12
NUMBER 4
DECEMBER 1989

An International Journal of Current Research
and Theory with Open Peer Commentary

Behavioral and Brain Sciences

Appearing in this issue, with Commentary . . .

On the function of muscle and reflex partitioning U. Windhorst,
T. M. Hamm & D. G. Stuart

**Selfishness examined: Cooperation in the absence of egoistic
incentives** L. R. Caporael, R. M. Dawes, J. M. Orbell & A. J. C. van de Kragt

**Multiple book review of *Speech perception by ear and eye:
A paradigm for psychological inquiry*** D. W. Massaro

C A M B R I D G E U N I V E R S I T Y P R E S S

ISSN 0140-525X

Behavioral and Brain Sciences

Editor

Stevan Harnad
20 Nassau St., Suite 240
Princeton, NJ 08542
E-mail: harnad@confidence.princeton.edu or
harnad@pucc.bitnet

Managing Editor
Chooi-Yeok Kuan

Copy Editor (Chief)
Avis Kniffin

Associate Editors

Behavioral Biology
Jack P. Hailman/U. Wisconsin
Hubert Markl/U. Konstanz

Biosocial Behavior
Glendon Schubert/U. Hawaii, Manoa

Cognition and Artificial Intelligence
Zenon Pylyshyn/U. Western Ontario

Cognitive Development
Annette Karmiloff-Smith/MRC, London and MPI, Nijmegen

Evolutionary Biology
Michael T. Ghiselin/California Academy of Sciences

Experimental Analysis of Behavior
A. Charles Catania/U. Maryland, Baltimore County

History and Systems
Julian Jaynes/Princeton

Language and Cognition
Philip Johnson-Laird/MRC, Cambridge
Peter Wason/University College, London

Language and Language Disorders
Max Coltheart/Macquarie U.

Linguistics
Robert Freidin/Princeton

Neurobiology
Irving Kupfermann/Columbia

Neuropharmacology
Susan D. Iversen/Merck Sharp and Dohme, Ltd.

Neuropsychology
Jeffrey A. Gray/Inst. Psychiatry, London
John C. Marshall/Radcliffe Infirmary, Oxford

Neurophysiology
Sten Grillner/Karolinska Institutet

Paleoneurology
Stephen Jay Gould/Harvard

Perception
Bruce Bridgeman/U. California
Richard Gregory/U. Bristol

Philosophy
Daniel C. Dennett/Tufts
Gilbert Harman/Princeton

Philosophy of Science
Adolf Grünbaum/U. Pittsburgh

Psychobiology
Victor H. Denenberg/U. Connecticut
David S. Olton/Johns Hopkins

Vision and Artificial Intelligence
Stuart Sutherland/U. Sussex

Editorial Policy *Behavioral and Brain Sciences* (BBS) is an international journal providing a special service called Open Peer Commentary* to researchers in any area of psychology, neuroscience, behavioral biology, or cognitive science who wish to solicit, from fellow specialists within and across these BBS disciplines, multiple responses to a particularly significant and controversial piece of work. (See *Instructions for Authors and Commentators*, inside back cover.) The purpose of this service is to contribute to the communication, criticism, stimulation, and particularly the unification of research in the behavioral and brain sciences, from molecular neurobiology to artificial intelligence and the philosophy of mind.

Papers judged by the editors and referees to be appropriate for Commentary are circulated to a large number of commentators selected by the editors, referees, and author to provide substantive criticism, interpretation, elaboration, and pertinent complementary and supplementary material from a full cross-disciplinary perspective. The article, accepted commentaries, and the author's response then appear simultaneously in BBS.

Commentary on BBS articles may be provided by any qualified professional in the behavioral and brain sciences, but much of it is drawn from a large body of BBS Associates who have become formally affiliated with the project.

Qualified professionals are eligible to become BBS Associates if they have (1) been nominated by a current BBS Associate, (2) refereed for BBS, or (3) had a commentary or article accepted for publication. A special subscription rate is available to Associates. Individuals interested in serving as BBS Associates are asked to write the editor.

This publication was supported in part by NIH Grant LM 03539 from the National Library of Medicine.

*Modelled on the 'CA Comment' service of the journal *Current Anthropology*.

Copying This journal is registered with the Copyright Clearance Center (27 Congress St., Salem, MA 01970). Organizations in the U.S.A. who are also registered with the CCC may therefore copy material (beyond the limits permitted by sections 107 and 108 of U.S. Copyright Law) subject to payment to the CCC of the per-copy fee indicated in the code on the first page of the article. This consent does not extend to multiple copying for promotional or commercial purposes.

ISI Tear Sheet Service, 3501 Market Street, Philadelphia, PA 19104, is authorized to supply single copies of separate articles for private use only.

For all other use, permission should be sought from the Cambridge or New York offices of the Press.

Subscriptions *Behavioral and Brain Sciences* (ISSN 0140-525X) is published quarterly in March, June, September, and December. Four parts form a volume. The subscription price, which includes postage, of Volume 12 (1989) is US \$154.00 net in the U.S.A. and Canada (£95.00 in the U.K.; £102.00 in the rest of the world) for institutions; US \$65.00 net (£43.00) for individuals; US \$38.00 net (£26.00) for BBS Associates; and US \$38.00 net (£26.00) for students (in the U.S.A. and Canada only) who provide proof of eligibility with order. Single parts cost US \$43.00 net (£26.00) plus postage. Institutional orders may be sent to a bookseller, or, in the U.S.A. and Canada direct to: Cambridge University Press, 40 West 20 Street, New York, NY 10011; in the U.K. and rest of the world to: Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 2RU, England. Individuals must order direct from the Press. Second class postage paid at New York, N.Y., and at additional mailing offices. Postmaster: send address changes in the U.S.A. and Canada to *Behavioral and Brain Sciences*, Cambridge University Press, 40 West 20 Street, New York, NY 10011.

Advertising Inquiries about advertising should be sent to the Journals Promotion Department of the Cambridge or New York Office of Cambridge University Press.

Contents Volume 12:4 December 1989

Windhorst, U., Hamm, T. M. & Stuart, D. G. On the function of muscle and reflex partitioning 629

Open Peer Commentary

- Abbs, J. H. & Edin, B. B. Muscle partitioning via multiple inputs: An alternative hypothesis 645
- Bässler, U. Muscle and reflex partitioning in insects? 646
- Bawa, P. & Calancie, B. Have studies of motor unit recruitment been too restrictive? 647
- Burke, D. Involvement of low-threshold motoneurons in reflex partitioning 648
- Burke, R. E. Functional partitioning of motor unit populations 648
- Cohen, A. H. Multiple mechanisms for partitioning 649
- Delcomyn, F. A comparative approach to muscle function 650
- Duysens, J. Partitioning of reflexes: A partitioned truth 651
- Edgerton, V. R., Roy, R. R. & Gregor, R. J. Motor unit architecture and interfiber matrix in sensorimotor partitioning 651
- English, A. W., Lennard, P. R. & Nichols, T. R. Clumping and splitting in the neuromuscular system 652
- Gandevia, S. C. Partitioning hypothesis in perspective 653
- Gans, C. Considering functional compartments in muscle 654
- Gielen, C. C. A. M. On neural mechanisms for muscle and reflex partitioning 655
- Hulliger, M. Partitioning in the fusimotor system? 656
- Hultborn, H. & Illert, M. Is "partitioning" an interesting concept? 657
- Jami, L. Some quantitative data on the sensory equipment of cat peroneal muscles 658
- Johansson, H. Partitioning and the γ -system 659
- Kernell, D. Central versus peripheral aspects of neuromuscular regionalization 660
- Loeb, G. E. & Richmond, F. J. R. Motor partitioning: Epiphenomena masquerading as control theory 660
- Maier, A. Oxidative indexes and muscle spindle densities 661
- Matthews, P. B. C. Muscle organization: Beware of counting trees when mapping the forest 662
- McCue, M. P., Guinan, J. J., Jr., Kobler, J. B. & Vacher, S. R. Acoustic reflex partitioning in the stapedius 663
- Mendell, L. M. Central partitioning may be altered during high-frequency activation of the Ia-motoneuron connection 665
- Munson, J. B. & Foehring, R. C. On the regional distribution of muscle spindles 666
- Person, R. Reflex partitioning and differential control of human motor units 667
- Proske, U. How useful is a concept such as muscle partitioning? 667
- Székely, G. A perfect design: The multifunctional muscle 668
- Tam, D. C. The physiological basis and implications of differential motor activation 669
- Taylor, A. Is sensory-motor partitioning a good hypothesis? 669

Authors' Response

- Windhorst, U., Hamm, T. M. & Stuart, D. G. What is the organization, scope, and functional significance of partitioning? 670

Caporael, L. R., Dawes, R. M., Orbell, J. M. & van de Kragt, A. J. C. Selfishness examined: Cooperation in the absence of egoistic incentives 683

Open Peer Commentary

- Brewer, M. B. Ambivalent sociality: The human condition 699
- Caraco, T. Sociality: Costs, benefits, and mechanisms 700
- Dunbar, R. I. M. Selfishness reexamined 700
- Eldredge, N. Biological underpinnings of social systems 702
- Findlay, C. S. & Lumsden, C. J. Cooperation is alive and well 702
- Foley, R. Ecological and social factors in hominid evolution 704
- Frank, R. H. Honesty as an evolutionarily stable strategy 705
- Gibbard, A. Selfish genes and ingroup altruism 706
- Gilbert, M. Folk psychology takes sociality seriously 707
- Heyman, G. M. The case of the "redundant" donor: Neither egoistic nor altruistic 708
- Houston, A. I. & Hamilton, W. D. Selfishness reexamined: No man is an island 709
- Katz, L. D. The rationality of cooperation 710
- Kenrick, D. T. Selflessness examined: Is avoiding tar and feathers nonegoistic? 711
- Knauff, B. M. Sociality versus self-interest in human evolution 712
- Krebs, D. Egoistic incentives in experimental games 713
- Lefebvre, V. A. "Social man" versus "conscientious man"? 714
- Liebrand, W. B. G. Do we need two souls to explain cooperation? 715
- Mansbridge, J. Love and duty: The new frontiers 717
- Oyama, S. Innate selfishness, innate sociality 717
- Rachlin, H. Ingroup bias is a kind of egoistic incentive 718
- Rapoport, A. Egoistic incentive: A hypothesis or an ideological tenet? 719
- Shweder, R. A. Too important to be left to rational choice 720
- Sonuga-Barke, E. J. S. The fallacy of selfish selflessness 721
- Stearns, S. C. Demonstrating unselfishness: They haven't done it yet 722
- Stenseth, N. C. Can we afford not to believe that man is selfish? 722
- Teigen, K. H. Counting contributions 723

Tetlock, P. E. The selfishness-altruism debate: In defense of agnosticism	723	Wallach, L. & Wallach, M. A. How best to critique egoism?	726
Tooby, J. & Cosmides, L. Evolutionary psychologists need to distinguish between the evolutionary process, ancestral selection pressures, and psychological mechanisms	724	Authors' Response	
Vine, I. Selfishness, sociobiology, and self-identities: Dilemmas and confusions	725	Caporael, L. R., Dawes, R. M., Orbell, J. M. & van de Kragt, A. J. C. Thinking in sociality	727

Massaro, D. W. Multiple book review of *Speech perception by ear and eye: A paradigm for psychological inquiry* 741

Open Peer Commentary

Anderson, N. H. Speech perception as information integration	755	Kanevsky, D. A multiple source, or, is a striped apple more striped than a striped orange?	767
Bernstein, L. E. Independent or dependent feature evaluation: A question of stimulus characteristics	756	Krueger, L. E. Cognitive impenetrability of perception	768
Bornstein, M. H. Discrimination and categorization across the life span	757	MacKay, D. G. Is <i>Paradigm</i> a new and general paradigm for psychological inquiry? Read my lips	770
Campbell, R. Seeing speech is special	758	Pastore, R. E., Logan, R. J. & Layer, J. K. Continuous and discrete models and measures of speech events	772
Cowan, N. Speech perception by ear, eye, hand, and mind	759	Port, R. F. The fuzzy logical model of perception: A teaspoon for a pyramid	773
Crowder, R. G. Categorical perception of speech: A largely dead horse, surpassingly well kicked	760	Studdert-Kennedy, M. Paradigm lost	774
Cutler, A. Straw modules	760	Townsend, J. T. Winning "20 Questions" with mathematical models	775
de Gelder, B. & Vroomen, J. Models in the mind, modules on the lips	762	Warren, R. M. The use of mathematical models in perceptual theory	776
Ehret, G. Categorical/continuous perception: A phenomenon pressed into different models	763	Welch, R. B. A comparison of speech perception and spatial localization	776
Gigerenzer, G. A general algorithm for pattern recognition?	764	Wilkening, F. Strong inferences about development	777
Glucksberg, S. From speech perception to person perception? Not quite yet	765	Author's Response	
Gósy, M. Speech perception from a Hungarian perspective	766	Massaro, D. W. The logic of the fuzzy logical model of perception	778