



The Journal of the Gilded Age and Progressive Era

Volume 8

Number 4

October 2009

Published by the Society for
Historians of the Gilded Age
and Progressive Era

Additional sponsors: Illinois
State University, the College
of William and Mary,
Santa Clara University, and
the Rutherford B. Hayes
Presidential Center

Forum

Should We Abolish the “Gilded Age”?

Essays by *Rebecca Edwards*,
Richard R. John, and *Richard Bense*

Essays

Vagabond Abroad: Mark Twain’s
1895 Visit to New Zealand

Rob Weir

The National Progressive Republican League
and the Elusive Quest for Progressive Unity

William B. Murphy

Toward a Middle-Class Cinema: Thomas Ince
and the Social Problem Film, 1914–1920

Nancy J. Rosenbloom

Book Reviews

www.jgape.org



Editor: Alan Lessoff, Illinois State University

Associate Editor: Scott Nelson, College of William and Mary

Book Review Editor: Nancy C. Unger, Santa Clara University

Online Editor: John McClymer, Assumption College

Founding Editor, 2000–2003: Maureen A. Flanagan, Michigan State University

Editorial Assistant: JoAnne Geigner

Copyeditor/Proofreader: Tracy Brown

Editorial Board

Lloyd E. Ambrosius
University of Nebraska, Lincoln

William Becker
George Washington University

Jørn Brøndal
University of Southern Denmark

Charles W. Calhoun
East Carolina University

James J. Connolly
Ball State University

Kathleen Dalton
Phillips Academy, Andover

John Enyeart
Bucknell University

Kathryn Allamong Jacob
Schlesinger Library, Radcliffe

Pamela W. Laird
University of Colorado, Denver

Kate Masur
Northwestern University

Robyn Muncy
University of Maryland

Katherine Osburn
Tennessee Tech University

Michael Perman
University of Illinois, Chicago

Linda Przybyszewski
University of Notre Dame

Pamela Riney-Kehrberg
Iowa State University

Ian Tyrrell
University of New South Wales

Articles appearing in this journal are abstracted and indexed in AMERICA: HISTORY AND LIFE and HISTORICAL ABSTRACTS.

A member of the History Cooperative, the journal is available online to individual and institutional subscribers at <www.historycooperative.org>. Instructions for accessing the online edition appear toward the back of this issue. The journal is also archived in JSTOR <www.jstor.org>, with issues older than five years available to subscribers of JSTOR's Arts & Sciences Collection.

Change of Address: Contact <craigkl@indiana.edu> or <wgamber@indiana.edu>.

Copyright permission: SHGAPE has contracted with Copyright Clearance Center, Inc., such that copyright permission requests for use of content owned by SHGAPE should be processed through CCC. Such requests may be submitted via their website at <www.copyright.com>. Requests may also be emailed to CCC at <info@copyright.com>.

ISSN: 1537-7814 Publications Agreement No. 40639038

© Society for Historians of the Gilded Age and Progressive Era

CONTENTS

Editor's Note 459

FORUM: SHOULD WE ABOLISH THE "GILDED AGE"?

Politics, Social Movements, and the Periodization of U.S.
History 463

Rebecca Edwards

Who Were the Guilders? And Other Seldom-Asked Questions
about Business, Technology, and Political Economy in the
United States, 1877-1900 474

Richard R. John

Comments 481

Richard Bensel

ESSAYS

Vagabond Abroad: Mark Twain's 1895 Visit to New Zealand
Rob Weir 487

The National Progressive Republican League and the Elusive
Quest for Progressive Unity 515

William B. Murphy

Toward a Middle-Class Cinema: Thomas Ince and the Social
Problem Film, 1914-1920 545

Nancy J. Rosenbloom

BOOK REVIEWS

See reverse

[On the back cover: Mark Twain performing at Dunedin City Hall, New Zealand,
November 8, 1895, as sketched by New Zealand artist William Mathew Hodgkins.
Courtesy of the Alexander Turnbull Library, Wellington, New Zealand.]

BOOK REVIEWS

- Critical Americans: Victorian Intellectuals and Transatlantic Liberal Reform* by Leslie Butler
Reviewed by Christopher McKnight Nichols 573
- Signs of Grace: Religion and American Art in the Gilded Age* by Kristin Schwain
Reviewed by Peter W. Williams 577
- Mary Elizabeth Garrett: Society and Philanthropy in the Gilded Age* by Kathleen Waters Sander
Reviewed by John Thomas McGuire 580
- Free Comrades: Anarchism and Homosexuality in the United States, 1895–1917* by Terence Kissack
Reviewed by Martin Meeker 582
- Americanizing the Movies and “Movie-Mad” Audiences, 1910–1914* by Richard Abel
Reviewed by Nancy J. Rosenbloom 585
- The Wilsonian Moment: Self-Determination and the International Origins of Anticolonial Nationalism* by Erez Manela.
Reviewed by Stuart Schaar 587

The *Journal of the Gilded Age and Progressive Era* is a peer-reviewed journal published quarterly by the Society for Historians of the Gilded Age and Progressive Era (SHGAPE), with assistance from the Rutherford B. Hayes Presidential Center, Illinois State University, Santa Clara University, Assumption College, Indiana University, and the College of William and Mary. It publishes original scholarly essays covering the period 1865 to 1920 and reviews scholarly books on that time period.

Subscription rates are \$50 for individuals, \$90 for institutions, \$20 for graduate students, \$60 for joint membership (one *Journal* subscription and two memberships to the Society), \$70 for sustaining, and \$110 for patron memberships. There is an additional charge of \$5 for subscriptions from outside the United States, including Canada and Mexico. For subscriptions or single issues, please contact Kalani Craig or Wendy Gamber, c/o Department of History, Indiana University, Ballantine 742, 1020 E. Kirkwood Ave., Bloomington, IN 47405, or <craigkl@indiana.edu> or <wgamber@indiana.edu>. Subscriptions include SHGAPE membership, which also brings a semiannual *Newsletter* and notices of SHGAPE sessions at annual conferences of the American Historical Association and the Organization of American Historians.

Manuscripts should be submitted electronically in MS Word or RTF format, or sent in triplicate to the editor, Alan Lessoff, Department of History, Illinois State University, Normal, IL 61790-4420. Before submitting any manuscript, please consult the website <www.jgape.org> for details on correct format and citation style. Information may also be obtained via email <ahlesso@ilstu.edu>.