

# Law and History Review

## Law and History Review

---

**Editor**

Christopher Tomlins  
*American Bar Foundation*

**Book Review Editor**

William J. Novak  
*University of Chicago*

**Managing Editor**

Diane Clay  
*American Bar Foundation*

---

*Law and History Review* (ISSN 0738-2480) is published twice a year, in spring and fall, by the University of Illinois Press for the American Society for Legal History. The purpose of the *Review* is to further research and writing in the fields of the social history of law and the history of legal ideas and institutions. The *Review* is sent to all members of the American Society for Legal History. Information about membership in the Society appears on the inside back cover of this issue.

Address all business inquiries (subscriptions, membership applications, back-issue orders, advertisements, and change-of-address notices) to the Journals Department, University of Illinois Press, 1325 South Oak Street, Champaign, Illinois 61820-6903. Requests for replacement of damaged or undelivered issues will be honored for up to six months after publication of the issue.

For authorization to photocopy from *Law and History Review* for uses exceeding those permitted by Sections 107 and 108 of the U.S. Copyright Law, contact the Copyright Clearance Center (CCC), 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923. The CCC will send an invoice for permissions fees. Permissions given above do not extend to copying for advertising or promotional purposes or to creating new collective works.

---

© 1997 by the Board of Trustees of the University of Illinois. Manufactured in the United States of America.

*This journal is printed on acid-free paper.*

# Law and History Review

---

Volume 15, Number 2

Fall 1997

---

*Published twice a year by the University of Illinois Press  
for the American Society for Legal History*

## Editorial Board

David Abraham  
*University of Miami*

William P. Alford  
*Harvard University*

Mary Frances Berry  
*University of Pennsylvania*

Thomas Brennan  
*U.S. Naval Academy*

Martin Chanock  
*La Trobe University,  
Melbourne*

Elaine Clark  
*University of Michigan,  
Dearborn*

Martha F. Davis  
*NOW Legal Defense,  
New York*

Thomas J. Davis  
*SUNY, Buffalo*

Cornelia Dayton  
*University of California,  
Irvine*

Laura Engelstein  
*Princeton University*

Jean-Marie Fecteau  
*Université du Québec  
à Montréal*

Christian G. Fritz  
*University of New Mexico*

Judy Fudge  
*York University, Toronto*

Paul Hyams  
*Cornell University*

Nancy Isenberg  
*University of Northern Iowa*

Bruce Kercher  
*Macquarie University, NSW*

Diane Kirkby  
*La Trobe University,  
Melbourne*

Michael Klarman  
*University of Virginia*

David Konig  
*Washington University,  
St. Louis*

Mindie Lazarus-Black  
*University of Illinois at  
Chicago*

Kenneth F. Ledford  
*Case Western Reserve  
University*

Brian P. Levack  
*University of Texas at Austin*

Janette Neeson  
*York University, Toronto*

Kent Newmyer  
*University of Connecticut*

James P. Oakes  
*Northwestern University*

John V. Orth  
*University of North Carolina*

Steven Pincus  
*University of Chicago*

W. Wesley Pue  
*University of British  
Columbia*

Nicole Hahn Rafter  
*Northeastern University*

Gerry R. Rubin  
*University of Kent,  
Canterbury*

Lucy E. Salyer  
*University of  
New Hampshire*

John Henry Schlegel  
*SUNY, Buffalo*

Stephen A. Siegel  
*De Paul University*

Rayman L. Solomon  
*Northwestern University*

Robin Chapman Stacey  
*University of Washington*

Robert J. Steinfeld  
*SUNY, Buffalo*

Emily Z. Tabuteau  
*Michigan State University*

Victor M. Uribe  
*Florida International  
University*

Barbara Y. Welke  
*University of Oregon*

James Q. Whitman  
*Yale University*

Stephen C. Yeazell  
*University of California,  
Los Angeles*

## Note to Contributors

The editors welcome unsolicited manuscripts and books for review. Address manuscript submissions, queries, and all editorial correspondence to Christopher Tomlins, The American Bar Foundation, 750 North Lake Shore Drive, Chicago, Illinois 60611 (tel. 773 988 6553; fax 773 988 6579). Address books for review to William J. Novak, Department of History, University of Chicago, 1126 East 59th Street, Chicago, Illinois 60637 (tel. 312 702 7938; fax 312 702 7550). Manuscripts must be submitted in double-spaced typescript throughout, with citations prepared according to the *Chicago Manual of Style*, 14th ed. Please use word processing wherever possible. Manuscripts submitted for publication are subject to double-blind peer review; authors should therefore identify themselves on the title page only. Accepted manuscripts are copyedited for style but not substance; authors remain responsible for citation accuracy and for all statements of fact or opinion. The *Law and History Review* will not consider any manuscript concurrently submitted for publication elsewhere. Submission of a manuscript is understood to commit its author to publish the manuscript in the *Law and History Review* if accepted by the editor.

# Contents

---

Law and History Review	Vol. 15, No. 2, Fall 1997
In This Issue	viii
<b>Articles</b>	
Hands across the Water: The Making and Breaking of Marriage between Dutch and Scots in the Mid-Eighteenth Century	215
Rab Houston and Manon van der Heijden	
A Late Medieval Conflict of Laws: Inheritance by Illegitimates in <i>Ius Commune</i> and <i>Ius Proprium</i>	243
Thomas Kuehn	
<b>Forum: On the Intellectual History of Law and Economics</b>	
Law and Neoclassical Economics: Science, Politics, and the Reconfiguration of American Tort Law Theory	275
James R. Hackney, Jr.	
Law and Economics, Science and Politics	323
Neil Duxbury	
The Intellectual Roots of the Law and Economics Movement	
James J. Heckman	327
Science, Politics, and the Evolution of Law and Neoclassical Economics	
James May	333
<b>Exchange: On the History of the Right to Bear Arms</b>	
Response to Bellesiles's Review of <i>To Keep and Bear Arms: The Origins of an Anglo-American Right</i>	339
Joyce Lee Malcolm	
Reply to Malcolm	343
Michael Bellesiles	
The H-LAW Resource Page	347

## Book Reviews

- Fiefs and Vassals: The Medieval Evidence Reinterpreted*  
—Susan Reynolds 349  
reviewed by Stephen D. White
- From Personal Duties towards Personal Rights: Late Medieval and Early Modern Political Thought, 1300–1600*—Arthur P. Monahan 356  
reviewed by Kenneth Pennington
- The Humiliation of Sinners: Public Penance in Thirteenth-Century France*—Mary C. Mansfield 358  
reviewed by John W. Baldwin
- The Usatges of Barcelona: The Fundamental Law of Catalonia*  
—Donald J. Kagay, translator 359  
reviewed by James F. Powers
- An Economy of Violence in Early Modern France: Crime and Justice in the Haute Auvergne, 1587–1664*—Malcolm Greenshields 361  
reviewed by Orest Ranum
- Marriage, Property, and Law in Late Imperial Russia*  
—William G. Wagner 363  
reviewed by Laura Engelstein
- Law and Disorder on the Narova River: The Kreenholm Strike of 1872*  
—Reginald E. Zelnik 365  
reviewed by Lewis Siegelbaum
- The Village in Court: Arson, Infanticide, and Poaching in the Court Records of Upper Bavaria, 1848–1910*—Regina Schulte 367  
reviewed by Mindie Lazarus-Black
- Women, Crime and the Courts in Early Modern England*  
—Jenny Kermode and Garthine Walker, editors 369  
reviewed by Pat McCune
- Marriage, Debt, and the Estates System: English Landownership 1650–1950*—John Habakkuk 371  
reviewed by Eileen Spring
- The Hanging Tree: Execution and the English People, 1770–1868*  
—V. A. C. Gatrell 373  
reviewed by Michael Meranze
- Witnessing Insanity: Madness and Mad-Doctors in the English Court*  
—Joel Peter Eigen 375  
reviewed by Martin J. Wiener

<i>Private Property, Government Requisition and the Constitution, 1914–1927</i> —G. R. Rubin	377
reviewed by Neil Duxbury	
<i>Inventions and Official Secrecy: A History of Secret Patents in the United Kingdom</i> —T. H. O'Dell	378
reviewed by A. W. B. Simpson	
<i>The Chief Governors: The Rise and Fall of Reform Government in Tudor Ireland, 1536–1588</i> —Ciaran Brady	380
reviewed by Pdraig Lenihan	
<i>The Irish Constitutional Tradition: Responsible Government and Modern Ireland, 1782–1992</i> —Alan J. Ward	382
reviewed by Frank A. Biletz	
<i>The Politics of Codification. The Lower Canadian Civil Code of 1866</i> —Brian Young	384
reviewed by Jean-Marie Fecteau	
<i>The Limits of Affluence: Welfare in Ontario, 1920–1970</i> —James Struthers	387
reviewed by Margaret E. McCallum	
<i>Nationalism and Federalism in Australia</i> —W. G. McMinn	389
reviewed by Richard Lucy and Bruce Kercher	
<i>The Documentary History of the Supreme Court of the United States, 1789–1800: vol. 5, Suits against States</i> —Maeva Marcus et al., editors, and <i>A Guide to the Early Reports of the Supreme Court of the United States</i> —Morris L. Cohen and Sharon Hamby O'Connor	391
reviewed by William R. Casto	
<i>The Populist Persuasion: An American History</i> —Michael Kazin, and <i>Self-Rule: A Cultural History of American Democracy</i> —Robert H. Wiebe	394
reviewed by Richard D. Parker	
<i>Home to Work: Motherhood and the Politics of Industrial Homework in the United States</i> —Eileen Boris, and <i>Bound by Our Constitution: Women, Workers, and the Minimum Wage</i> —Vivien Hart	398
reviewed by Nancy Gabin	
<i>Labor Struggles, 1945–1950: A Participant's View</i> —Irving Richter	402
reviewed by Craig Becker	

- American Indian Treaties: The History of a Political Anomaly*  
—Francis Paul Prucha 404  
reviewed by Greg Lind
- Lone Wolf v. Hitchcock: Treaty Rights and Indian Law at the End of the Nineteenth Century*  
—Blue Clark 406  
reviewed by Vine Deloria, Jr.
- The Southern Tradition: The Achievement and Limitations of an American Conservatism*—Eugene Genovese 408  
reviewed by Stephen B. Presser
- Tainted Breeze: The Great Hanging at Gainesville, Texas, 1862*  
—Richard B. McCaslin 409  
reviewed by Christopher Waldrep
- New South—New Law: The Legal Foundations of Credit and Labor Relations in the Postbellum Agricultural South*—Harold D. Woodman 411  
reviewed by Sally E. Hadden
- Federal Criminal Law Doctrines: The Forgotten Influence of National Prohibition*—Kenneth M. Murchison 413  
reviewed by Richard F. Hamm
- Witch Hunt in Wise County: The Persecution of Edith Maxwell*  
—Gary Dean Best 415  
reviewed by James Goodman
- Cloak and Gavel: FBI Wiretaps, Bugs, Informers, and the Supreme Court*  
—Alexander Charns 416  
reviewed by Arthur J. Sabin
- A Nation under Lawyers: How the Crisis in the Legal Profession Is Transforming American Society*—Mary Ann Glendon 419  
reviewed by William P. LaPiana
- Federal Justice in Western Missouri: The Judges, the Cases, the Times*  
—Lawrence H. Larsen 421  
reviewed by David C. Frederick
- The Chief Justiceship of Melville W. Fuller, 1888–1910*  
—James W. Ely, Jr. 422  
reviewed by John E. Semonche
- Hugo Black: A Biography*—Roger K. Newman 424  
reviewed by Melvin I. Urofsky

<i>Brennan vs. Rehnquist: The Battle for the Constitution</i> —Peter Irons reviewed by Sue Davis	426
<i>War and Law since 1945</i> —Geoffrey Best, and <i>Presidential War Power</i> —Louis Fisher reviewed by Jonathan Lurie	428
<i>African Americans and the Living Constitution</i> —John Hope Franklin and Genna Rae McNeil reviewed by Martha F. Davis	430
<i>Law and the Company We Keep</i> —Aviam Soifer reviewed by Stephen C. Yeazell	432
<i>Oedipus Lex: Psychoanalysis, History, Law</i> —Peter Goodrich reviewed by Ian Duncanson	434
<i>Armageddon at Waco</i> —Stuart A. Wright, editor reviewed by Jeffrey Kaplan	436

JAMES WILLARD HURST

October 6, 1910 – June 18, 1997

News of the death of Willard Hurst reached the *Law and History Review* as this issue was going to press. Few American scholars, whether lawyers or historians—or both—would contest the *New York Times*' description of Willard Hurst as “the dean of American legal historians” (20 June 1997). But Hurst's name is known to legal historians the world over, for in our field he was assuredly one of the giants of the twentieth century, his intellectual influence reaching well beyond the continental United States, his civility and scholarly generosity earning him the respect and affection of all who encountered him.

Obituaries have already appeared to mark Hurst's death. For a scholarly journal, however, it seems most appropriate to honor a great scholar not with ceremonies of passing but with signs of continuing engagement. The *Law and History Review* will therefore plan to devote a future issue to Willard Hurst as legal historian, his work and its impact.